Historical Causation and Argumentation...The Second Great Awakening & Reforms

From the 2015 Revised Framework:

Causation - Historical thinking involves the ability to identify, analyze, and evaluate the relationships among historical causes and effects, distinguishing between those that are long term and proximate. Historical thinking also involves the ability to distinguish between causation and correlation, and an awareness of contingency, the way that historical events result from a complex variety of factors that come together in unpredictable ways and often have unanticipated consequences.

Argumentation - Historical thinking involves the ability to create an argument and support it using relevant historical evidence. Creating a historical argument includes defining and framing a question about the past and then formulating a claim or argument about that question, often in the form of a thesis. A persuasive historical argument requires a precise and defensible thesis or claim, supported by rigorous analysis of relevant and diverse historical evidence. The argument and evidence used should be framed around the application of a specific historical thinking skill (e.g., comparison, causation, patterns of continuity and change over time, or periodization). Furthermore, historical thinking involves the ability to examine multiple pieces of evidence in concert with each other, noting contradictions, corroborations, and other relationships among sources to develop and support an argument.

From the 2015 Revised Rubric for the Long Essay - Describes causes AND/OR effects of a historical event, development, or process. Explains the reasons for the causes AND/OR effects of a historical event, development, or process. (2 of 6 possible points) Scoring Note: If the prompt requires discussion of both causes and effects, responses must address both causes and effects in order to earn both points.

From the 2015 Revised Content Outline:

Key Concept 4.1: The United States began to develop a modern democracy and celebrated a new national culture, while Americans sought to define the nation’s democratic ideals and change their society and institutions to match them.

II. While Americans embraced a new national culture, various groups developed distinctive cultures of their own.
   A) The rise of democratic and individualistic beliefs, a response to rationalism, and changes to society caused by the market revolution, along with greater social and geographical mobility, contributed to a Second Great Awakening among Protestants that influenced moral and social reforms and inspired utopian and other religious movements.
   B) A new national culture emerged that combined American elements, European influences, and regional cultural sensibilities.
   C) Liberal social ideas from abroad and Romantic beliefs in human perfectibility influenced literature, art, philosophy, and architecture.
   D) Enslaved blacks and free African Americans created communities and strategies to protect their dignity and family structures, and they joined political efforts aimed at changing their status.

III. Increasing numbers of Americans, many inspired by new religious and intellectual movements, worked primarily outside of government institutions to advance their ideals.
   A) Americans formed new voluntary organizations that aimed to change individual behaviors and improve society through temperance and other reform efforts.
   B) Abolitionist and antislavery movements gradually achieved emancipation in the North, contributing to the growth of the free African American population, even as many state governments restricted African Americans’ rights. Antislavery efforts in the South were largely limited to unsuccessful slave rebellions.
   C) A women’s rights movement sought to create greater equality and opportunities for women, expressing its ideals at the Seneca Falls Convention.
Prompt: Evaluate the causes and effects of the Second Great Awakening. To what extent did this movement maintain continuity in American belief systems?

1. What is the purpose of your essay? What are your parameters?

2. Explain how you will ATFP, then brainstorm facts and evidence. Start in the middle of the graphic (causes) then move outward to effects and continuities.

HISTORICAL CAUSATION AND ARGUMENTATION...The Second Great Awakening & Reforms

CONTINUITIES MAINTAINED:

ONE OR TWO MAJOR CAUSES OF THE SECOND GREAT AWAKENING

Extent?

A SHORT TERM EFFECT:

LONG TERM EFFECTS:
3. Using the amended thesis formula below to write your thesis. Don’t forget to ATFP!

**LC. X. However A and B. Therefore, Y**

What are the major causes of “event” and what were the most important short and long term consequences of “event”?

LC: scene of this essay by explaining one or two major causes of the event and briefly characterizing the era.

X = identify and explain one short term effect, with an explanation how or why – linked to a theme or organizational category which will also be topic of first body paragraph

A, B = 2 long term consequences linked to Y, explanations of how or why, broken into organizational categories (topics of your 2nd and 3rd body paragraphs)

Y = your assertion statement including your analysis of extent
HISTORICAL CAUSATION #2... impact of REFORMS on EXPANDING DEMOCRATIC IDEALS

Prompt #2: Evaluate the extent to which Jackson Era [“Jacksonian Democracy” or “Era of the Common Man”] reform movements expanded democratic ideals.

1. What is your purpose? What are your parameters?

2. Other than reform movements, what other forces expanded Democratic ideals during this time period?

3. How did reform movements impact democratic ideals? Review the reform movements below (potential evidence for your essay) and explain how each impacted (or not) democratic ideals. Add additional evidence to each reform movement.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Most Emphasized Reform Movements</th>
<th>Impact on Democratic Ideals (how and to what extent)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Religion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deism, Unitarianism, Baptist, Methodist, Mormons, <strong>Second Great Awakening</strong>, Evangelicalism, Peter Cartwright, Francis Asbury, Burned Over District, Joseph Smith, Brigham Young, Camp Meetings, William Miller – Millerites – Adventists</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temperance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temperance Societies, Temperance legislation, T.S. Arthur - Ten Nights in a Bar Room and What I Saw There, Neal Dow, Maine Laws</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abolition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women’s Movement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cult of Domesticity, Susan B. Anthony, Lucretia Mott, Margaret Fuller – The Dial, Declaration of Sentiments, Seneca Falls, Sojourner Truth – Aint I a Woman?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utopianism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enlightened Rationalism, Romanticism, Transcendentalism, Ralph Waldo Emerson, Henry David Thoreau, Robert Owen, Oneida, New Harmony, Shakers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**HISTORICAL CAUSATION #2... impact of REFORMS on EXPANDING DEMOCRATIC IDEALS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Other Reform Movements</th>
<th>Impact on Democratic Ideals (how and to what extent)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Immigration</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nativism, Irish Immigration, Great Potato Famine,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German Immigration, Anti-Catholicism, Know Nothing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Party (American Party)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Education</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public School Movement, Horace Mann, Women's</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education, Troy Seminary – Emma Willard, Mount</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holyoke, Oberlin College, Curriculum Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Prisons and Mental Facilities</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dorothea Dix – Mental Asylums, Eastern State</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Penitentiary (Pennsylvania System), Auburn System</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. What impacted democratic ideals *more*, reforms or the other forces?

5. Using your *standard* thesis formula, write your thesis in the space below. Make sure to ATFP!

   **LC. Although X, Y because ABC**
   
   What are the major causes or consequences of “event” and what were the most important causes or consequences of “event”?  
   LC = local context… set the scene by briefly describing the era and event  
   X = least important cause or consequence, with an explanation why; explained thoroughly with a piece of specific evidence  
   A, B, C = most important causes / consequences, explanations why, broken up into organizational categories  
   Y = your assertion statement
HISTORICAL CAUSATION #2... impact of REFORMS on EXPANDING DEMOCRATIC IDEALS

6. Analyze each document. Annotate in the space provided. Your annotation should include any inference that could be used in your essay to help you defend your thesis. Identify the theme/category (your ABC paragraph themes) for each piece of evidence, and contextualize as well. (Think HIPP) The first one has been completed for you.


We might feel a pride in the reflection, that our young country... was the first to adopt the penitentiary system of prison discipline, and the first to attempt to prevent the commission of crimes, by seeking out the youthful and unprotected, who were in the way of temptation, and by religious and moral instruction, by imparting to them useful knowledge, and by giving them industrious and orderly habits, rescuing them from vice and rendering them valuable members of society.

To confine these youthful criminals... where no, or scarcely any, distinction can be made between the young and old, or between the more and less vicious, where little can be learned but the ways of the wicked, and from whence they must be sent to encounter new wants, new temptations, and to commit new crimes, is to pursue a course, as little reconcilable with justice as humanity; yet, till the House of Refuge was established there was no alternative.

Source: Engraving by Patrick Reason, 1835.

Theme: Culture and/or political participation in reform movements, including women, (prison reform, for example) as a contributor to expanded democracy

Context of Reform: Prison Reform... evidence of impact of Second Great Awakening... Instead of punishing teens, teach them about religion (Christianity as solution to immoral behavior) and teach them skill (so they can work and be productive). Impact is expanded liberty and basic rights for youth and the incarcerated.

Supporting Y: Impact on democracy - Protect and teach youth, increase population of good citizenry.

Theme:

Context of Reform:

Supporting Y:
HISTORICAL CAUSATION #2... impact of REFORMS on EXPANDING DEMOCRATIC IDEALS

Source: Samuel F.B. Morse, *Imminent Dangers to the Free Institutions of the United States*, 1835.

In our national infancy we needed the strength of numbers. . . Now emigration is changed; naturalization has become the door of entrance not alone to the ever welcome lovers of liberty, but also for the priest-ridden troops of the Holy Alliance. . . Now emigrants are selected . . . not for their affinity to liberty, but for their mental servitude, and their docility in obeying the orders of their priests. . .

It may be, Americans, that you still doubt the existence of a conspiracy. . . Do you wish to test its existence and its power? . . . Test it by attempting a change in the Naturalization Law. Take the ground that such a change must be made, that no foreigner who comes into the country after the law is passed shall ever be allowed the right of suffrage.


In order to more effectually promote the great purposes of human culture; . . . to apply the principles of justice and love to our social organization in accordance with the laws of Divine Providence; to substitute a system of brotherly cooperation for one of selfish competition; to secure to our children . . . the benefits of the highest physical, intellectual and moral education . . . to institute an attractive, efficient, and productive system of industry; . . . to diminish the desire of excessive accumulation, by making the acquisition of individual property subservient to upright and disinterested uses; to guarantee to each other forever the means of physical support, and of spiritual progress;—we the undersigned do unite in a voluntary Association . . .

Source: Elizabeth Cady Stanton, Seneca Falls Declaration, August 2, 1848.

. . . But we are assembled to protest against a form of government, existing without the consent of the governed—to declare our right to be free as man is free, to be represented in the government which we are taxed to support, to have such disgraceful laws as give man the power to chastise and imprison his wife. . . And, strange as it may seem to many, we now demand our right to vote according to the declaration of the government under which we live.

NOTES:

- When incorporating document analysis into your evidence list and essay… you must have BOTH outside evidence (not found in the document) as well as your inferences from the documents.
- You must contextualize each document if you want to get a top score.